

Paper presented at the conference on “Gender Budgets, Financial Markets, Financing for Development”, February 19th and 20th 2002, by the Heinrich-Boell Foundation in Berlin

**Gender Responsive Budget Initiatives:
Some Key Dimensions and Practical Examples**

Professor Diane Elson
University of Essex, UK

Introduction

Most governments have expressed a commitment to gender equality objectives and to gender mainstreaming, but often there is a gap between policy statements and the ways in which governments raise and spend money. Most governments have also expressed commitments to greater transparency and accountability, but there is often a gap between participation and consultation in the formulation of new policies and legislation and in the allocation of resources.

Gender responsive budget initiatives can help to close these gaps, ensuring that public money is raised and spent more effectively. They can help to ensure the realisation of gender equality goals and improved compliance with the Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women. They can help promote greater accountability for public resources to the people of a country, especially to women, who are generally more marginalised than men in decision-making about public money.

What is a Gender Responsive Budget Initiative?

A gender responsive budget initiative does not aim to produce a separate budget for women. Instead it aims to analyse any form of public expenditure, or method of raising public money, from a gender perspective, identifying the implications and impacts for women and girls as compared to men and boys. The key question is: what impact does this fiscal measure have on gender equality? Does it reduce gender inequality; increase it; or leave it unchanged?

The focus on gender inequality can be structured so as to take account of other forms of inequality, such as class, race and region. The key question might be reformulated, for example, as: does this fiscal measure improve, worsen, or leave unchanged, the position of the most disadvantaged women?

A gender budget initiative always involves a gender analysis of some dimension of the raising and use of public money. But there is no single way of doing this. There

are a number of analytical tools that can be used (see for example, Diane Elson, 'Integrating Gender Issues into National Budgetary Policies and Procedures: Some Policy Options' *Journal of International Development*, Vol 10 (pp929-941) 1998 and Debbie Budlender and Rhonda Sharp, *How to do a gender-sensitive budget analysis: contemporary research and practice*, Commonwealth Secretariat and Australian Agency for International Development, 1998).

The practical organisation of the initiative can take several forms:

Political location

- at national, regional, or local levels of government
- inside government departments, organised by officials and ministers
- in elected assemblies, organised by elected representatives
- outside government, organised by researchers and civil society organisations

An interactive, consultative, process involving all of the above has been found to be particularly effective (see Debbie Budlender, *Review of Gender Responsive Budget Initiatives*, Commonwealth Secretariat, 2001). Gender responsive budgeting needs to be organised in ways that democratise the ways in which budgets are made and implemented, and give more voice to women's concerns.

Coverage

- the whole budget (rarely attempted, to date)
- expenditure of selected departments or programmes
- expenditure on new projects
- selected forms of revenue (taxes, user fees etc)
- changes in the tax system
- implementation of new legislation

The expenditures and revenues to be covered are generally selected in the light of analysis of the pattern of gender inequality, women's priorities, and government policy on gender inequality in the country concerned.

Budget classification

Budget figures can be presented in a number of ways, each of which might be used as a point of departure:

- line item (expenditure by payments eg salaries, travel, equipment, buildings etc)
- functional (expenditure by broad purpose eg policing, defence, education, health, transport, etc)
- economic (financial operations by economic impact eg capital and current expenditures and revenues; subsidies; transfer payments; interest payments; financing operations)
- administrative (expenditure by institution responsible for managing funds)
- programme (expenditures according to programmes, considered as a set of activities undertaken to meet the same objectives)
- territorial (revenues and expenditures by geographical area of impact)

The line item, functional, and administrative classifications are primarily designed for purpose of control, to keep expenditures within the legal bounds enacted in the budget legislation. The economic classification is designed to facilitate analysis of the impact

on the macroeconomy. The programme and territorial classifications are particularly appropriate points of departure for inequality analysis, but in some countries they are not available, or are underdeveloped.

Stage of budget cycle

The gender budget initiative may target a particular phase of the budget cycle.

- planning to identify objectives
- appraisal to identify financial allocations to meet objectives
- audit to identify any misappropriation of money
- evaluation of the extent to which objectives have been met

Planning and appraisal are constrained by pre-commitments to existing activities, which may be difficult to change.

Audit and evaluation should feedback into planning and appraisal but at best will do so with a lag, since next year's budget has to be prepared before this year's budget has been audited and evaluated. The links between the stages are often weak.

The budget may be linked to a multi-year expenditure plan, which may be targeted as well as the yearly budget.

Presentation of analysis

Results of gender analysis of expenditures and revenues may be presented in different ways and by different actors:

- at a number of points in the main budget and/or evaluation report
- in a special annexe to the main budget report and /or evaluation
- in briefing papers for parliamentarians
- in press releases
- in submissions to government task forces, planning groups, inquiries etc
- in research publications
- in popular education publications

Consideration needs to be given to the most effective way of presenting the analysis from the point of view of accountability, transparency and democratic participation in budget processes.

A Functional Framework for Relating Budgets to Gender Equality

The details of gender responsive budgeting will need to be designed in a country-specific way. But the general principle will always be that of bringing together two bodies of knowledge which have usually been kept separate: knowledge of gender inequality and knowledge of public finance and public sector programmes.

If the budget cycle is taken as the point of departure, then it may be helpful to think in terms of the following framework, which focuses on the impact of activities covered by the budget. It may be used in the planning and appraisal and in the audit and evaluation phases.

For each Ministry or Programme selected, look at planned and realised *Inputs, Activities, Outputs, and Impacts*. (NB, there are often important gaps between the plans, as presented in the budget and other documents, and the realisation, as revealed in audits and evaluations.)

Inputs consist of the money appropriated and spent

(as presented in the Functional or Programme Classification)

Activities consist of the services planned and delivered
e.g. health services, industrial support services, social transfers, tax collection
(These may not always be well-specified and it may not clear how much money should or did reach the point at which the activities interface with the public. One challenge is to enable the public to monitor the disposition of funding)

Outputs consist of the planned and delivered utilisation of the activities
e.g. patients treated, businesses supported, incomes increased, taxes collected
(Desired *Outputs* and indicators of them may not always be well-specified-one challenge is to improve specification and to identify sources of relevant statistics)

Impacts consist of planned and actual achievements in relation to broader objectives
e.g. healthy people, competitive businesses, poverty reduction, sustainable growth of national income
(Desired *Impacts* and indicators of them may not always be well-specified-one challenge is to improve specification and to identify sources of relevant statistics. A further challenge is that links between *Outputs* and *Impacts* may be uncertain and complex)

A gender budget analysis can be conducted, irrespective of whether gender equality has been explicitly specified as a desired outcome and impact of the Ministry or Programme, by asking whether planned, and realised,

Impacts promote gender equality, as well as other objectives

Outputs are fairly distributed between women and men and are adequate to achieve gender equality, as well as other, objectives

Activities are designed to be equally appropriate for women and men and are adequate to achieve gender equality, as well as other, objectives

Inputs are adequate to achieve gender equality, as well as other, objectives

To answer these questions sex-disaggregated data will be needed and an understanding of the relevant gender relations. A variety of tools and approaches, including participatory approaches, are available to conduct this analysis. Dialogue between officials and civil society organisations is recommended. (This approach can be applied to raising revenue as well as to expenditure, by treating the costs of collecting revenue as the input, the process of collection as the activity, the revenue to be raised as the output and the impact of the taxes, charges etc on incomes as the impact. However more work needs to be done in this area.)

If the answer to these questions is NO, then changes need to be identified in the identification of impact and output objectives, organisation of activities and deployment of funding so as to close the identified gender gaps. It is likely that progress can be made through a better specification of impact and output objectives;

and by changing the priorities that determine activities and funding. Gender equality is frequently complementary to other policy objectives. However, if trade-offs are discovered between gender equality and other objectives, these should be noted and ways of reducing the trade-off should be investigated.

Attention should also be paid to gender issues which cross the boundaries between Ministries and Programmes. For example, to reduce inequality between boys and girls in the incidence of public expenditure on education may not only require changes in Programmes for Primary and Secondary Schooling in the Ministry of Education, but also in a range of other Programmes and Ministries.

To bring about change, the results of the analysis must be effectively conveyed to policymakers and the public through reports, parliamentary questions and hearings, policy dialogues, newspapers, books, popular educational materials, and public meetings. An informed discussion should be facilitated and ways found to enable the public to participate in the setting of budget priorities, paying particular attention to enabling women to formulate and express their ideas. The extent of women's existing participation in budget decision-making needs to be examined, as has been done by the government of Tanzania:

'More than half of all Tanzanians are females. But only a small number of the people who make important decisions about the government budget are women. For example, only 3 of the 30 members of the Finance and Economic Committee of Parliament are women and only 45 of the 275 Members of Parliament are women. With so few women making the budget it is not surprising that it does not effectively meet women's needs.'

Government of Tanzania, *'Status Report on Integrating Gender into the National Budgetary Process in Tanzania'*, Sixth Meeting of Commonwealth Ministers Responsible for Women's Affairs, New Delhi, April 2000, p.5.

Gender responsive budgeting is about process as well as about analysis. However, other presentations at this conference will discuss that in more detail. The rest of this paper will concentrate on examples of gender budget analysis.

Some Examples of Gender Budget Analysis

Initiatives of various sorts are underway in a large number of countries. A short paper cannot do justice to their variety and achievements. A few examples are presented here to illustrate the kind of analysis that has been done in some of the pioneering countries. Several of them are taken from analysis done in the three countries that volunteered to be pilots in the Gender Budget Initiative lead by the Commonwealth Secretariat from 1996 onwards (South Africa, Sri Lanka and Barbados). Some of the examples are from analysis presented in official government documents and some from analysis conducted by NGOs engaged in policy dialogue with governments.

Audit and Evaluation of the Budget

1. Audit of Distribution of Actual Inputs, Activities and Outputs

This kind of analysis links expenditures actually made to the actual participation in the activities provided and enjoyment of the outputs. It is useful where individual participation can be identified. It can be presented in a variety of ways, focussing on distribution of outputs, or funding, or both.

The National Public Works Programme in South Africa

‘Approximately R350 million has been allocated to the National Public Works Program from national budgets since 1994. The Community Based Public Work Program (CBPWP) accounts for R250 million of this. Some provinces have added funds from their own budgets.

A 1997 evaluation of the program found that the quality of the assets produced was exceptionally high compared to similar programs elsewhere in the world. It found the 599 projects to be well-distributed geographically with respect to the relative poverty profiles of the nine provinces.....

Of those employed on the projects, 41 per cent were women and 12 per cent were youths. While the figure for women is lower than the female proportion of the population in the rural areas in which the projects operate, it is almost certainly higher than would have been the case without explicit targeting. Unfortunately, the evaluation suggests that women were often assigned the more menial jobs, that their average wages were lower, that they were generally employed for shorter periods than men, and that they were less likely than men to receive training. 37 per cent of men who were employed received training, compared to 32 per cent of women.

The evaluation results have formed the basis of the Department’s current plans to fine-tune the program and further improve targeting.’

Source: Department of Finance, Republic of South Africa, *Budget Review 1998*, Pretoria, p.6.44

New Deal Programmes for the Unemployed in UK

New Deal programmes aim to get more get people of working age who are not currently in paid work into the market for jobs. Figures from the Department for Education and Employment show that only 27 per cent of participants in the New Deal for young unemployed people are female; and only 16 per cent of those in the New Deal for the long term unemployed. In the case of the New Deal for lone parents 95 per cent of participants are female. The programmes have been analysed by Katherine Rake of the UK Women’s Budget Group, a women’s Think Tank that is regularly consulted by the UK government. She found that 57 per cent of the funding available for New Deal programmes goes to the programme for young people, 23 per cent goes to the programme for long-term unemployed, and only 8 per cent to the programme for lone parents. (The rest goes on a number of other smaller schemes). Rake estimates that double the amount of money is spent per person in the programme for young people than in the programme for lone parents.

Source: Katherine Rake, ‘Into the Mainstream? Why Gender Audit is an essential tool for policymakers’ *New Economy*, Vol 7 No 2 (pp107-110) June 2000

Expenditure in Selected Ministries, Sri Lanka

‘This study has found that, in fact, there was equality of access and usage in the main service sectors; in education, 48 per cent of recurrent expenditure benefited females, in health 56 per cent and in the social services 57 per cent, but there were specific pockets where inequalities persisted..... in the area of social services it is clear that current funding levels are quite inadequate for maintaining the basic living standards of target beneficiaries or for rehabilitating them.

In the ministries concerned with the production sectors investigated i.e. agriculture and industry, the access and participation of women in government supported programmes was low and the perpetuation of the assumption that programmes in these areas are gender-neutral is likely to leave unchanged or increase the gender difference and disadvantages that women face in these sectors. There is a need to revise the underlying policies, devise appropriate programmes and delivery systems and carry out gender-disaggregated programmes assessments on a regular basis, with the intention of equalising opportunities and access for men and women.’

Source: Department of National Planning, Ministry of Finance and Planning, *Engendering the National Budget of Sri Lanka*, CENWOR, Colombo, 2000, p.45

2. Evaluation of Adequacy of Funding for Women’s Empowerment and Realisation of Women’s Rights.

A fair distribution of actual expenditure and services between women and men will not by itself ensure that women are empowered and their human rights realised if key programmes are not prioritised for funding. It is useful to compare actual expenditure with expenditure that would be required to achieve specific quantifiable objectives.

Expenditure on adult basic education and training in South Africa

In South Africa in 1995, 20 per cent of all African women and 14 per cent of all African men over the age of 20 years had no formal schooling. 7.4 million people were illiterate, of whom 4 million were women. Only about one-third of a million people were enjoying adult basic education and training (ABET) programmes in 1994. About 29 per cent of them were in programmes run by the state and the majority of them were women (59 per cent as compared to 41 per cent men.). The government allocation to ABET programmes was only 1 per cent of the allocation to education in 1996/97. A plan for ABET in South Africa was drawn up in 1994 by the Centre for Education Policy Development (a South African NGO). Its objective was to reach 3 million learners in 5 years. The proposed budget for the first year of the plan was 132 million Rand. The plan was not put into action. Public expenditure on ABET in 1997/8 was 2.5 million Rand, falling to 1.9 million Rand in 1998/9.

Source: Karen Hunt and Debbie Budlender (eds.) *Money Matters- Women and the Government Budget*, Idasa, Capetown, 1998.

Shelter for Battered Women in Barbados

'Between 1992-1996 there were 764 applications for protection orders, of this number 730 women were applying for legal protection against their male abusers....While on the whole national levels of crime are on the decline, there has been a marked increase in "crimes against the person" and specifically sex crimes perpetrated on women and physical violence against women....the establishment of a shelter for Battered Women became an urgent requirement. An NGO, the Business and Professional Women's Club advanced the initiative, with start-up funds (\$380,000) provided by the Ministry of Social Transformation.....The Shelter began receiving residents in November 1999.....However, there remains a significant number of women who need assistance but that the Shelter is unable to accommodate....

Management at the Shelter estimate that it takes an average of \$900 dollars to house one adult Shelter Victim per month. This figure rises with the number of children and specific needs of a family being sheltered. While financial shortfalls concerning the physical establishment and upkeep of the Shelter (such as fencing) are important security issues, the inability of the NGO to secure sufficient funds to underwrite the major portion of operation costs is an even more significant problem. Currently, the Ministry discharges its responsibility to the Shelter in contracts renewable each year. There is no clear indication whether after this first year, the funds provided will be increased or whether they will be forthcoming past the support for the physical infrastructure and maintenance of the facility.'

Source: Donna St Hill, *Gender Analysis of the National Budget: 1998-99, Barbados Pilot*, Draft, Commonwealth Secretariat, London, p 37-38

Planning and Appraisal of the Budget

Incorporating gender analysis into planning and appraisal of the budget requires identifying likely gender dimensions of activities, outputs and impacts.

Industrial Support in Australia

'The communications equipment industry is characterised by a predominantly female workforce. However, as with the majority of industries in the high technology sector, women workers predominate in the unskilled areas of employment, mostly process work, and have made little progress in technical and management areas.

...Financial support of \$400.000 will be provided in 1986/87 to assist the industry. The first stage of the Government's plan involved a reduction in tariffs. The second stage sought the development of a comprehensive industry development strategy...The net result of successful implementation of the strategy will not mean an overall decrease in employment, however increased automation will lead to a decline in unskilled work. The potential for growth in employment in this industry lies in the technical and management areas such as research and development and marketing skills.

Given the limited numbers of women in the technical and management areas it can be assumed that barriers to women's participation in these areas of employment exist. The obvious barriers are in the fields of education and training, particularly in the numbers of young women in the science disciplines in secondary and tertiary

education institutions. While the Department's programs cannot seek to reduce these barriers to women's employment, affirmative action legislation and efforts by the Department of Education to increase the number of women and girls in science related training, will assist in increasing women's employment opportunities in technical and management areas.'

Source: Department of the Prime Minister and Cabinet and Office of Status of Women, Commonwealth of Australia, *Women's Budget Program: An Assessment of the Impact on Women of the 1986-87 Budget*, p 180

Infrastructure Development in South Africa

'Investment in infrastructure builds economic capacity and enhances competitiveness, while contributing to the quality of life of poor people. Energy, transport, communications and social infrastructure bring significant benefits to women and children, particularly.

Capital expenditure financed by the national and provincial governments is expected to increase... capital spending on water schemes and related infrastructure of R 1 537 in 1998/99, increasing to R 1785 million in 2000/1.

.....

In late 1995 only one third of African households and less than three-quarters of coloured households had running tap water inside their dwellings, compared to 97 per cent of Indian and white households. Outside urban areas only 12 per cent of African households had an inside tap and 21 per cent had a tap on the site, while 28 per cent were collecting water from a river, stream, dam or well and 16 per cent from a bore hole. One in six African households who had to fetch water were forced to travel at least a kilometre to do so. In 1993 the average time spent on the task by members of rural African households who collected water was 1 hour and 40 minutes. The average time spent by individual women who collected water was over an hour, at 74 minutes. Just over half of rural African women over the age of 18 were spending part of their time collecting water.'

Source: Department of Finance, Government of South Africa, *Budget Review 1998*, Pretoria (p 1.5 and 6.58).

Support for women's entrepreneurship in France

'Women still account for a minority of entrepreneurs, creating only 27% of all new businesses. To help change this:

- FF 10 million in additional resources has been earmarked for the Special Women's Guarantee Fund (FGIF), corresponding to the creation of 1000 new businesses in 2001; and,
- Government-supported networks of assistance for entrepreneurs are being asked to boost the number of women they assist by 25% over three years.'

Source: Government of France, *Draft 2001 Budget Act: Review of Appropriations for Actions in Support of Women's Rights*, p.13. (Translated by OECD for 22nd Annual Meeting of Senior Budget Officials, May 2001, PUMA/SBO(2001)7)

Translating the Beijing Platform for Action into Programme Activities and Budget Items in Kenya

'A concept paper on "Translation of the Beijing Platform for Action into the 1998/99 Kenya National Budgetary Process" was prepared by the collaborative Centre for Gender and Development in conjunction with International federation of Women Lawyers (FIDA-K). This concept paper identifies and discusses six critical areas of concern namely: poverty, education and training, health, taxation, women in agriculture and economy.

For the implementation in the 1998/99 national budgetary process, a policy framework matrix and budget estimates for the Beijing Platform for Action was prepared by the same team. The policy matrix has translated the Beijing platform for Action into specific programme activities and budget items.

The policy matrix and budget estimates...has been shared with planners and economists in the Government and private sectors and also with many NGOS....The sharing was a deliberate move to lobby for support and good will to engendering the national budget process.'

Source: Collaborative Centre for Gender and Development, *Engendering the National Budget and Economic Policies*, p. XXI, mimeo, Nairobi.

Tax Credits in the UK

'The Women's Budget Group welcomes recognition that while the Working Families Tax Credit (WFTC) has brought benefit to many families, it should be reformed to make it more effective by splitting it into two separate tax credits, Employment Tax Credit (ETC) and Integrated child Credit (ICC). In particular, we welcome two features of the ICC: that it will go some way to providing an integrated and seamless system of financial support for children that is unrelated to parents employment status and that it will be paid to the children's principle carer.....

Any employment incentive effects should be targeted on men and women equally, so that work pays equally well for both sexes and that a sharing of caring and earning roles between parents is encouraged. This should enable couples to make decisions about hours of work that allow them both time for their children and the opportunity to take employment. Current incentives work in such a way that for many families it is most practical for one parent to work long hours while the other takes on the bulk of caring responsibilities and only a secondary labour market role, if any. Unequal pay and the difficulties of finding suitable childcare are primarily responsible for these patterns. It is therefore particularly important that government policy does not exacerbate the inequalities...

The WFTC, because it is designed primarily to get at least one parent from workless households into employment, can act as a disincentive to second earners in households (despite the child care tax credit). This is because a second earner in a family claiming WFTC faces a high tax rate of 55% with no individual incentive to start. Indeed there is a disincentive to sharing hours and caring responsibilities between the two parents, with a premium being paid if one partner is employed for 30 hours or more, but no premium if those hours are shared between partners.

It is important that these features are not reproduced in the ETC/ICC system and that everyone is treated equally by any incentive to take employment. Not to do so not only indirectly discriminates against women, who are more likely to be second earners, but is very short-sighted in terms of preventing household, and thus, child poverty. Many households depend on two earners to keep them out of poverty and

much employment these days is insecure. Households with only a single earner are not only likely to be poor: they will become workless if the sole earner loses their job. Further, with increasing family breakdown many of today's second earners will be tomorrow's single parents.'

Source: Women's Budget Group, 'Submission to H.M.Treasury on the proposal for an Integrated Child Credit', London 2000.

Two Guiding Principles for Gender Budget Analysis

It is useful to keep in mind the following two principles in doing gender budget analysis. Gender budget analysis has much in common with other forms of equality analysis of budgets. But these two principles distinguish gender budget analysis.

Assessment on an Individual as well as a Household Basis

It is important to assess the budget from the point of view of poor households as compared to rich households. But it is also important to look within households and assess the budget from the point of view of individual women and men, recognising that although households do share some resources, this is often done in ways that are incomplete and inequitable.

Only if budgets are informed by individual as well as household assessment of likely impacts can women be treated as citizens in their own right and not merely as dependants of men. Only this will ensure that the budget is not based on the inaccurate assumption that all income coming into a household is pooled and equally shared by all members of the household.

Systematic Recognition of the Contribution of Unpaid Care Work

The extent to which a country achieves its social and economic objectives depends not only on the amount of paid work its people do, but also on the amount of unpaid work its people do caring for their family members and neighbours, and upon the amount of free time people have for leisure and for civic activities. Unpaid care work is still unequally shared between women and men in most countries and this is one of the major obstacles to equality in paid work and to the full development of the talents of both women and men. A key dimension of a budget's impact on gender equality is the impact on the amount of unpaid care work that has to be done. It is especially important to look at this in the context of expenditure cuts and reforms which are expected to improve effectiveness and efficiency. Information about unpaid care work is provided by time use surveys which are becoming available in a wide range of countries.

Pay -Off to Ministers of Finance as well as to Ministers of Women's Affairs

Gender budget initiatives can have a pay-off in terms of effectiveness in achieving other goals besides that of equality between women and men. Two examples:

Improved Targeting

Gender analysis shows that it frequently matters whether measures directly impact upon men or women, even when they are living together in the same household. For instance, a budget which aims at reducing child poverty will be frequently be more effective if it targets additional income specifically into the hands of mothers rather than of fathers. A wealth of evidence from a wide range of countries shows that men, even poor men, frequently keep back some of their income for personal discretionary use for leisure activities, while women are more inclined to contribute the whole of their income to the family 'pot' and to spend it ways that are directly beneficial to children.

Avoidance of False Economies

Gender analysis shows that there is a danger that measures to reduce or contain the financial costs of public sector services may actually transfer or perpetuate real costs, in terms of time use, to women as principle carers for family members. For example, measures to reduce the financial costs of health services by shortening the time that patients stay in hospital for post-operative recovery may transfer the burden of convalescent care to women in the home. In turn this can have a knock-on effect, forcing women to be absent from their paid employment and lowering their productivity.

Future Challenges: Gender analysis of the budget as a whole.

A major purpose of the budget is to bring together all public expenditure and revenue and to provide an overview of public finances and their intended impact on the economy and the human well-being of a country. Gender responsive budgets need to provide an overview of the impact of the budget as a whole on gender equality objectives, as well as programme by programme impact.

One important step is to get recognition that gender equality issues are present in the work of all Ministries, and in a very wide range of programmes, not just in those programme that are targeted to improving the position of women. An example from Tanzania illustrates:

Gender as a cross-sectoral issue in Tanzania

'The Rolling Plan and Forward Budget for Tanzania in the period of 1996/97 – 1998/99 Vol.1 has indicated cross-sectoral issues as Environment, Cooperatives, Science and Technology, Rural and urban development, and Population. Gender has not been listed as a cross-sectoral issue.....As a result other sectors do not feel the obligation of taking aboard the responsibility of disaggregation and addressing gender gaps identified in the sectors. **Recommended Action** :An immediate action can be taken up to include gender among the list of the cross-sectoral issues in the guidelines....' Source: Tanzania Gender Networking Programme (TGNP), 'Report on review of the Planning and Budget Guidelines by the PC and MOF with a gender perspective' Dar-es-Salaam

'**Challenges/Lessons Learned.** Some initiatives have been taken to implement some of the recommendations resulting from studies on gender budgeting. These include: the 1999/2000 Budget guidelines incorporated gender issues.'

Source: Government of Tanzania, '*Status Report on Integrating Gender into the National Budgetary Process in Tanzania*', Sixth Meeting of Commonwealth Minister Responsible for Women's Affairs, New Delhi, April 2000, p. 5

Recognition of gender as a cross-cutting issue may be translated into a set of indicators for monitoring the gender sensitivity of the whole budget. A number of suggestions, based on the work on Debbie Budlender and Diane Elson, are made in UNIFEM, *Progress of the World's Women 2000*, New York, 2000, p.118.

Following on from the functional and programme classification of budgeted and actual expenditure, one could calculate indicators for planned and actual expenditure, such as:

- share in total expenditure of expenditure explicitly targeted to promoting gender equality
- share in total expenditure of expenditure devoted to public services prioritised by women
- share in total expenditure of expenditure devoted to income transfers prioritised by women.

Such indicators would be more refined versions of those popularised in the UN 20/20 initiative, which endeavours to get governments to commit 20 per cent of public expenditure to basic social services and aid donors to like wise commit 20 per cent of their funding to basic social services. One limitation of such indicators is that they do not capture how much expenditure actually gets translated into tangible benefits for women members of the public. A lot of the benefits may get captured by public sector employees operating at several removes from the public. Moreover, indicators of shares do not tell us whether real expenditure per capita has been rising or falling.

There is also need to look at indicators of activities, outputs and impacts. One possible indicator is gender equality in participation in activities undertaken by several ministries. For example:

- gender balance in enjoyment of support for business (eg subsidised credit)
- gender balance in enjoyment training provided for members of the public
- gender balance in bodies making decisions about utilisation of resources.

It would also be useful to have some measure of levels of satisfaction of men and women with the services provided. Participatory processes have an important role to play here.

It would also be possible to take the line item classification of the budget as a point of departure, and construct gender-sensitive indicators of expenditure on and participation in public sector employment and public sector purchase of good and services from the private sector. For example:

- gender balance in public sector employment (eg share of women in employment at each grade; average cost of female employees compared to average cost of male employees)
- gender balance in public sector contracts with private sector (eg share of women-owned businesses in total number and value of contracts).

Such indicators recognise that the public sector can promote (or hinder) gender equality as a purchaser as well as a provider.

None of these points of departure or indicators focus directly on the budget as a tool of macroeconomic policy. They do not take the economic classification of the budget as the point of departure or engage with the decisions about the desired aggregate levels of revenue and expenditure; and the extent to which governments should borrow further or pay down public debt. They do not examine the intersection with monetary policy. They do not examine the ways in which macro-economic objectives such as growth of GNP and rate of inflation are set and how such objectives are thought to be related to the budget. It is important to develop more gender budget analysis at this macro-economic level, because the macroeconomic decisions constrain the room for manoeuvre in changing budgets in a more gender equitable direction. Other things being equal, it is likely to be harder to change budget priorities in the direction of gender equality, and improvement of lives of poor women in particular, when the main emphasis is on cutting back expenditure and minimising taxation. There are strong lobbies for other priorities that are likely to carry more weight when cuts are being made.

The first step in engaging with the budget as a tool of macroeconomic policy is to get recognition that there is a gender dimension to macroeconomic objectives like increasing economic growth and productivity; and to macroeconomic aggregates like savings and investment, exports and imports, and the supply of labour. Relevant research is now being produced (see for instance, Special Issue of *World Development* on Growth, Trade, Finance and Gender Equality, Vol 28, No 7, July 2000). Moreover, some governments are beginning to see some connections between economic policy and gender equality policy. For instance the Government of India included a chapter on gender equality in its Economic Survey (2000), noting that as well as promoting substantive enjoyment of equal rights, gender responsive budgeting can benefit the economy through efficiency gains:

‘From the efficiency point of view, what is important is the social rate of return of investment in women, and in many cases, this can be higher than the corresponding rate for men.’

Another example is the dialogue between the UK Women’s Budget Group (an NGO) and the UK Treasury which has included seminars on the gender dimensions of productivity growth and of medium term labour supply projections (which impinge on assessments on the growth/inflation trade-off). Further development of gender responsive budgeting at the macro economic level is an important challenge for the future. This will need to include the intersection of national budgets with the global economy.

Acknowledgements

This paper draws upon the work of many people who are developing gender-responsive budget initiatives. I would particularly like to thank Debbie Budlender and Rhonda Sharp for many helpful discussions; colleagues in UNIFEM and the Commonwealth Secretariat for supplying materials used in this paper; and fellow members of the UK Women’s Budget Group for sharing their expertise.

